

**OCEAN SAMP CHAPTER 7. MARINE TRANSPORTATION, NAVIGATION & INFRASTRUCTURE - COMMENTS & RESPONSES (as of 8/9/10)**

<u>Record #</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Comment Period</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>	<u>Section</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Response</u>	<u>Notes</u>
133	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	710	"Newport in Narragansett Bay." Should read "Newport in Narragansett Bay, and the Massachusetts ports of Somerset and Fall River in Mt. Hope Bay."	Correction made	
134	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	720	Add to the end of that paragraph: "These shipping lanes and the precautionary area were designed in accordance with standards, and adopted under the auspices of the International Maritime Organization (IMO). While designed as a measure of safety to aid commercial shipping entering and exiting Narragansett Bay and Buzzards Bay, use of these lanes and precautionary area are not mandatory. Most prudent mariners will, however, transit within the appropriate traffic lanes when entering or exiting port."	Insertion made	
135	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	720	"not align" should read "not necessarily align"	Correction made.	
136	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"AIS is a government-mandated, transponder-based ship tracking system..." should read "AIS is a transponder-based ship identification system..."	Correction made.	
137	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"Generally, vessels required by law to use AIS include..."should read "Generally, vessels required by Federal regulation to carry an operational AIS include..."	Correction made.	
138	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"...Port of New York, is also required to carry an AIS system." Should read "...Port of New York, is also required to carry AIS."	Correction made.	
139	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	Recommend adding a footnote to this paragraph (I believe it would be footnote #5) that states: "In December 2008 the Coast Guard published a Notice of Proposed Rulemaking in which it was proposed that Federal regulations requiring the use of AIS be expanded to include: 1. Self-propelled vessels of 65 feet or more in length, engaged in commercial service. 2. Towing vessels of 26 feet or more in length and more than 600 horsepower, engaged in commercial towing. 3. Self-propelled vessels carrying 50 or more passengers, engaged in commercial service. 4. Vessels carrying more than 12 passengers for hire and capable of speeds in excess of 30 knots. 5. Dredges and floating plants operating near channels likely to restrict or affect navigation of other vessels. 6. Self-propelled vessels carrying or engaged in the movement of certain dangerous cargoes. As of the printing of this Ocean SAMP, final Coast Guard action on these proposed regulations still pends."	Insertion made	
140	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"...U.S. Coast Guard of traffic..." should read "...U.S. Coast Guard of commercial vessel traffic..."	Correction made	
141	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"...majority of vessel traffic..." should read "...majority of commercial vessel traffic..."	Insertion made	
142	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"Monthly AIS data for Block Island..." should read "Monthly AIS data for commercial vessel traffic in Block Island..."	Insertion made	
143	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"Providence or Fall River." Should read "Providence or Somerset." (Note that no coal is delivered to Fall River)	Correction made	
144	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"...destined for Fall River power plants..." should read "...destined for Somerset power plants..."	Correction made	

**OCEAN SAMP CHAPTER 7. MARINE TRANSPORTATION, NAVIGATION & INFRASTRUCTURE - COMMENTS & RESPONSES (as of 8/9/10)**

<u>Record #</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Comment Period</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>	<u>Section</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Response</u>	<u>Notes</u>
145	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"...Taunton River need to transfer cargo..." should read "...Taunton River sometimes need to transfer cargo..."	Insertion made	
146	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"...onto barges that can fit through the 35 foot controlling depth of the Brayton Point Channel." That statement is incorrect. Recommend checking the source document (Weaver's Cove Energy 2009). Perhaps you mean Mt. Hope Channel? (that makes sense). Give me a call if there's confusion on this issue.	Correction made	
147	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"...coal to Fall River..." should read "...coal to Somerset..."	Correction made	
148	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"Because the coal-powered facilities located in Somerset (across from Fall River) can require approximately 10,000 tons of coal per day to operate, a steady inflow of coal is required." Recommend adding "two" in front of "coal-powered" and also adding a footnote at the end of this sentence that reads "In December 2009 the NRG Energy coal-powered facility closed and ceased operations indefinitely. As of the printing of this Ocean SAMP a determination as to when, if ever, the facility may resume operations is unknown. If this facility is ultimately permanently closed, a significant reduction in coal barge and coal ship deliveries through the SAMP area to Mt. Hope Bay can be expected."	Correction/insertion made	
149	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"...and no into Narragansett..." should read "...and into Narragansett..."	Correction made	
150	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	730	"...Point Judith on Interstate..." should read "...Point Judith to Block Island on Interstate..."	Insertion made	
151	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	740	Recommend .."Provport" read "Provport (a private port facility located in Providence)"	Insertion made	
152	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	740	Typo after (Donovan 2003)	Correction made	
153	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	760	typo and there seems to be some info missing??	Correction made	
154	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	740	recommend delete the entire sentence that begins "Cargo brought to Fall River via the SAMP area..." Given that NRG Energy has shut down, that sentence is inaccurate.	Correction made	
155	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	760	Recommend "Most commercial ships..." read "Most commercial ships (not tug & barges)..."	Insertion made	
156	12/15/2009	TAC	Edward LeBlanc	USCG	770	The second and third sentences of para 1, and all of para 2, are key statements and should be included in the Executive Summary of the overall SAMP document...really good language. I'd recommend that the phrase "significant impact" in para 2 be changed to read "significant adverse impact". (As an aside, it may be worthwhile for you to consider adopting the criteria used by the Minerals Management Service to define "significant adverse impact." I can forward that criteria to you via separate e-mail if you're interested. It's the criteria the Coast Guard used when we evaluated the Cape Wind proposal.)	Policies will all eventually be integrated into one chapter: Chapter 11, New Policies. "Significant Adverse Impact" and MMS criteria are adopted.	CROSS-REFERENCE CH 11 NEW POLICIES.Refers to 770.1.1 and 770.1.2

**OCEAN SAMP CHAPTER 7. MARINE TRANSPORTATION, NAVIGATION & INFRASTRUCTURE - COMMENTS & RESPONSES (as of 8/9/10)**

<u>Record #</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Comment Period</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>	<u>Section</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Response</u>	<u>Notes</u>
122	12/16/2009	TAC	Allison Castellan	NOAA	700	Clearly identify which policies you intend to be enforceable and explain how they are enforceable. For any policy that you do intend to be enforceable, you should also be clear that it would only apply to state (and not Federal) waters within the SAMP area. If there are any Federal license and permit activities the CRMC would like to review in Federal waters, you would need to provide a geographic description for the area (if different then the SAMP boundary) and an analysis as to how these activities would have reasonable effects on RI coastal resources and uses.	This comment refers more broadly to the overall SAMP document and policy-making process, and is being evaluated in that regard.	CROSS-REFERENCE CH 11 NEW POLICIES.
123	12/16/2009	TAC	Allison Castellan	NOAA	700	In the final SAMP, it would also be nice to pull out all the enforceable policies for CZMA purposes in one place for quick and easy reference.	We plan to do so; they will all be included in Chapter 11, New Policies.	CROSS-REFERENCE CH 11 NEW POLICIES.
125	12/16/2009	TAC	Captain Paul Costabile	Northeast Marine Pilots	730	Pilot boats also operate in the Samp area. They transport marine pilots to arriving commercial vessels and take them off departing vessels. (Pilot boats don't assist cargo vessels in navigating.)	Correction made.	
127	12/16/2009	TAC	Captain Paul Costabile	Northeast Marine Pilots	730	Barges usually each carry an average of 20,000 tons of coal...(Coal barges don't carry 40,000 tons ships do. Barges carry about 20,000)	Correction Made	
128	12/16/2009	TAC	Captain Paul Costabile	Northeast Marine Pilots	730	Onto barges that can navigate the 35 foot controlling depth of the Brayton Point channel. (fit in doesn't sound right)	Correction made	
129	12/16/2009	TAC	Captain Paul Costabile	Northeast Marine Pilots	760	Generating \$40.9 million in wages.... (left out million)	Correction made	
173	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	700	There should be some discussion of the proposed LNG terminal and the challenges involved with large LNG vessel transits from the SAMP area into the Bay.	This is a proposed future use that will be discussed in Chapter 9: Other Future Uses.	CROSS REFERENCE CH 9: OTHER FUTURE USES.
174	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	700	A priority recommendation of the SAMP should be high-resolution bottom mapping [bathymetry] of the proposed anchorage area in the SAMP.	This is a research recommendation that will be recorded as a future research need.	CROSS REFERENCE FUTURE RESEARCH NEEDS.
171	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	700	This chapter is a thorough look at the infrastructure with an excellent job researching the topics and providing supporting data, graphs, etc., well done. Without access to the full draft SAMP, it is hard to evaluate the content and flow of chapter 7 within context of the overall document. I think I could have provided more support for the chapter had I been; -familiar with the entire document as to content and flow, - the purpose of the document and what update periodicity is planned.	No response needed.	
172	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	700	There was redundancy in stating that 'there is maritime activity in the SAMP area', this fact was characterized throughout the chapter to the point of distraction to this reviewer. It also may help the flow if the 'classes of shipping' be categorized by general displacement and listed in either 'size' or 'number of transits, from large to small.	Redundant language that was identified was removed/modified. Displacement added but ship length retained to address mixed audience.	

**OCEAN SAMP CHAPTER 7. MARINE TRANSPORTATION, NAVIGATION & INFRASTRUCTURE - COMMENTS & RESPONSES (as of 8/9/10)**

<u>Record #</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Comment Period</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>	<u>Section</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Response</u>	<u>Notes</u>
175	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	700	There should be more information provided on the Quonset/Davisville complex as it will expand as a port facility, especially as inter-modal marine transportation grows, and may be the single largest factor for increase maritime traffic in the SAMP area. There should be an explanation as to why the USACE does not maintain the Quonset/Davisville channel, again due to the projected grow of commercial and federal [NOAA] ships transiting to this complex.	Added info on NOAA ship Okeanos Explorer's expected use of Quonset-Davisville. Did not include any additional information as, per communication with Quonset Port Manager, at this time there are no other confirmed plans to expand uses of Q-D that are relevant to the SAMP area.	
176	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	700	Recommend adding a section that lists the charts that cover the SAMP area and the Bay, how they are maintained and how they can be procured.	Referred reader to NOAA Office of Coast Survey for further information on nautical charts and the U.S. Coast Pilot.	
177	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	700	rec adding ..'yet to be discovered marine debris'	Added "marine debris".	
178	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	710	consider adding...'Surface Warfare Officers School, Supply Officers School, Naval Academy Prep School...'	Added Naval Academy Prep School and Surface Warfare Officers School as they are listed on Naval Station Newport website.	
179	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	720	rec adding the channel draft limitations of all three entrances	Added draft limitations that are provided in the U.S. Coast Pilot.	
180	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	720	rec referencing submarine transit lanes on chart fig 2	Addition made.	
181	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	720	rec verifying the areas marked as sub transit areas, I think they are sub operating areas, subs transiting to New London usually surface off Groton/New London and follow transit channels surfaced	Sub transit lanes and Naval operating area were all verified by C. Tompsett from the Naval Undersea Warfare Center.	
182	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	730	rec referencing the 'size/draft' of the USACE transit data	These data are impractical to summarize and only reflect a small portion of traffic in the SAMP area. Referred reader to the data source, USACE Waterborne Commerce Statistics Center, for further info.	
183	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	730	table 1; is there double-counting of 'tow or tug' and 'barges'	No. Data are reported and presented here just as they are in the source documents (USACE Waterborne Commerce Statistics).	
184	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	730	rec checking on the requirement for fishing vessels to carry AIS and a brief explanation of how and where AIS data is assimilated ashore for traffic identification and density	Confirmed that fishing vessels are not required to carry AIS nor are they expected to be in the future. Referred reader to discussion of VMS in Chapter 5: Fisheries. Added additional available information on source of AIS data used in this analysis.	CROSS REFERENCE CHAPTER 5: FISHERIES
185	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	730	add,..and several US Navy and foreign Navy vessels visit the Newport Naval Base piers annually, usually on short notice due to security reasons.	Addition made.	
186	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	740	rec adding the criteria used by Homeland Security to designate Providence port as 'critical'	There is no set criteria. Clarified language and reference.	
187	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	760	economic impact of marine transportation is an important factor, recommend this para be expanded and , if not covered elsewhere in the SAMP, how it is a factor for the future of the Ocean State. Jobs are a prime initiative of the current Administration and providing funds to those agencies/projects that will increase employment.	Expanded paragraph; also added language to 760.1 emphasizing jobs.	
188	12/16/2009	TAC	Dick West	USN-RET	760	rec adding that NUEC is located on the N Bay as it provides access to the SAMP area needed for testing and evaluation.	Added this to section on naval vessels, 730.7.	

**OCEAN SAMP CHAPTER 7. MARINE TRANSPORTATION, NAVIGATION & INFRASTRUCTURE - COMMENTS & RESPONSES (as of 8/9/10)**

<u>Record #</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Comment Period</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>	<u>Section</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Response</u>	<u>Notes</u>
161	12/17/2009	TAC	C. Tompsett	NUWC DIVNPT	720	These paragraphs (paragraphs 1-3) cite specific navigational features (the A and NB buoys and the Buzzards Bay Entrance light) and refer the reader to Figure 1. The figure does not include these features.	Figure revised	
163	12/17/2009	TAC	C. Tompsett	NUWC DIVNPT	720	Zoom in so the scale is the same as the other maps and only the Alpha submarine lane is displayed.	Figure revised	
165	12/17/2009	TAC	C. Tompsett	NUWC DIVNPT	730	Naval vessels also pass through the area while travelling to and from ports. They also engage in testing activities in the SAMP area.	Correction/clarification made	
166	12/17/2009	TAC	C. Tompsett	NUWC DIVNPT	730	The summary sentence doesn't match the rest of the paragraph. It says on average 2 to 3 commercial vessels enter the Bay per day based on the Weaver's Cove EIS. However, the statistics presented in the paragraph states that there are approximately 2600 commercial vessel transits in and out of Narragansett Bay in a year which would imply about 1300 vessels or 3 to 4 per day. Either resolve the discrepancy between the stats presented and the Weaver's Cove EIS or present them as separate data points.	Correction made	
167	12/17/2009	TAC	C. Tompsett	NUWC DIVNPT	730	Change "Newport Naval Station" to "Naval Station Newport"	Correction made	
168	12/17/2009	TAC	C. Tompsett	NUWC DIVNPT	730	Shorten to: "Submarines travel on the surface from New London through the southwest corner of the SAMP boundary area to reach deepwater Naval Fleet Operations submarine lanes."	Correction made	
169	12/17/2009	TAC	C. Tompsett	NUWC DIVNPT	740	The last two sentences refer to Table 6, should be Table 7.	Correction made	
170	12/17/2009	TAC	C. Tompsett	NUWC DIVNPT	750	There is also the federally designated Rhode Island Sound Disposal Site which is located towards the southern end of the Narragansett Bay traffic lane separation zone. <a href="http://www.nae.usace.army.mil/vironm/damos/risds.htm">http://www.nae.usace.army.mil/vironm/damos/risds.htm</a> provides a summary discussion as well as links to the EIS and the final rule that designated it.	Correction made to both figure and relevant text.	
124	12/17/2009	TAC	Captain Paul Costabile	Northeast Marine Pilots	720	For entry into Narragansett Bay the Brenton Point Pilot Station is used. For entry into Long Island Sound the Point Judith Pilot Station is used. The Montauk Pilot Station is only used by special arrangement due to the less favorable sea conditions that persist at that location. (We rarely board at Montauk Pilot Station. The conditions must be very good.)	Correction made.	
164	12/17/2009	TAC	CDR J. Landis	Chief of Naval Operations	720	Suggest changing "optimal weather" to "appropriate weather."	Correction made	
131	12/17/2009	TAC	Stephen Curtis	ProvPort, Inc.	730	ProvPort has two auto export liner services shipping used automobiles from Providence to the Middle East and West Africa since 2007 in addition to scrap steel exports.	Addition made	
132	12/17/2009	TAC	Stephen Curtis	ProvPort, Inc.	760	ProvPort has updated the statistics for economic activity. Please see the attached file pages 3-4. This report was updated and completed in June 2009.	Updated information included	
126	12/18/2009	TAC	Melville P. Cote, Jr.	USEPA	700	No comments on this chapter	No response needed.	

**OCEAN SAMP CHAPTER 7. MARINE TRANSPORTATION, NAVIGATION & INFRASTRUCTURE - COMMENTS & RESPONSES (as of 8/9/10)**

<u>Record #</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Comment Period</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>	<u>Section</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Response</u>	<u>Notes</u>
193	12/22/2009	TAC	Matt Wingate	NOAA	720	Not currently annotated on NOAA charts. USCG is the deciding authority. NOAA will chart when given the go-ahead by USCG. Side note--I understand the USCG is considering to chart this route. Not sure when though	USCG gave permission to indicate that this charting change has been approved and is in the process of being implemented.	
194	12/22/2009	TAC	Matt Wingate	NOAA	720	This is confusing. The pilot boarding area at the entrance to Narragansett Bay (south of Brenton Point, is inside state waters. Perhaps the pilots board an inbound vessel south of this boarding area which would then be outside of state waters. See also 730.2, number 9.	Added clarifying language.	
195	12/22/2009	TAC	Matt Wingate	NOAA	720	Suggest inserting, "see the U.S. Coast Pilot Vol. 2". This would then be similar to other Coast Pilot references. For example, see 720.3, number 1, or 720.1, number 3	Insertion made.	
196	12/22/2009	TAC	Matt Wingate	NOAA	720	Similar comment to Coast Pilot reference in 720.7, number 1.	Insertion made	
197	12/22/2009	TAC	Matt Wingate	NOAA	720	Suggest deleting "the" after "In 2008" in the first line.	Correction made	
198	12/22/2009	TAC	Matt Wingate	NOAA	730	The pilot boarding area south of Brenton Point is inside state waters. I think I understand the evolution. The pilots board an inbound vessel while it is greater than 3 nm off shore and south (outside) of the Brenton Point pilot boarding area. See comment on 720.5, number 1.	Added clarifying language	
199	12/22/2009	TAC	Matt Wingate	NOAA	730	Presently, no ferry routes are annotated on the chart. This may change if the CG decides to chart the route between Block Island and Pt. Judith.	USCG gave permission to indicate that this charting change has been approved and is in the process of being implemented.	
200	12/22/2009	TAC	Matt Wingate	NOAA	760	Suggest inserting "million" after \$40.9.	Correction made	
201	12/22/2009	TAC	Matt Wingate	NOAA	760	Delete space(s) after "and" in the 8th line or insert missing information	Correction made	
202	12/22/2009	TAC	Matt Wingate	NOAA	770	Are the Northeast Marine Pilots a federal entity? ...or a state entity?	Clarification made	
203	1/5/2010	Informal	Karina Lutz	RI Power		Not very specific to our area, but looks good.	No response needed	